Scientific, Technical and Economic Committee for Fisheries (STECF)

Monitoring the performance of the Common Fisheries Policy (STECF-15-04)

Edited by Norman Graham, John Casey and Hendrik Doerner

This report was reviewed by the STECF by written procedure in March 2015

Abstract

An ad hoc Expert Group on ‘Monitoring the performance of the Common Fisheries Policy’ composed of JRC experts was held on 10-11th February 2015 at JRC, Ispra, Italy. The ad hoc report was finalized and subsequently reviewed by the STECF by written procedure in March 2015.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Monitoring the performance of the Common Fisheries Policy (STECF-15-04) ......................... 4  
Background ........................................................................................................................................ 4  
Terms of reference ............................................................................................................................. 4  
STECF response ................................................................................................................................. 5  
CONTACT DETAILS OF STECF MEMBERS AND ADHOC EXPERT GROUP ................. 6  
Report to the STECF ......................................................................................................................... 10  

MONITORING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE COMMON FISHERIES POLICY (STECF-15-04)

The STECF review and adoption of the report of the ad hoc Expert group to monitor the performance of the Common Fisheries Policy was undertaken during March 2015.

BACKGROUND

Article 50 of the Common Fisheries Policy (CFP; Regulation (EU) No 1380/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2013) stipulates:

“The Commission shall report annually to the European Parliament and to the Council on the progress on achieving maximum sustainable yield and on the situation of fish stocks, as early as possible following the adoption of the yearly Council Regulation fixing the fishing opportunities available in Union waters and, in certain non-Union waters, to Union vessels.”

To facilitate such a report, in October 2014, the Commission requested the STECF to review and advise on suitable metrics and indicators. Based on the STECF Report (STECF 14-23), the Commission requested that an ad hoc Expert Group be convened to address the following Terms of Reference and prepare a report for review by the STECF.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1. Determine, on the basis of the most recent available fish stock assessments, a list of fish stocks for monitoring the past performance of the Common Fisheries Policy according to the following criteria:
   a. Quantitative assessments as used in the provision of formal quantitative advice on fishing mortality with respect to Fmsy.
   b. Stocks in European Union waters, shared stocks which are jointly managed by the EU with nearby states, and stocks in international waters or third country waters that are fished by the EU and managed by an RFMO where the EU is a member of the decision making body.

2. For stocks within the sampling frame defined above, calculate the following annual quantities as far back in time as the data remain representative.
   a. Number of stocks where fishing mortality exceeds Fmsy
   b. Number of stocks where fishing mortality is equal to or less than Fmsy
c. Number of stocks outside safe biological limits
d. Number of stocks inside safe biological limits
e. Number of stocks for which the state of the stock is unknown with respect to safe biological limits
f. The arithmetic average value of F/Fmsy

For the purposes of this term of reference, "outside safe biological limits" means that SSB is less than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), OR F is greater than Fpa (where Fpa is defined) for the year in question.

Estimates should be provided separately for the Baltic Sea, the North Sea, Western Waters, for each area covered by RFMOs other than NEAFC. Parameter f should also be reported for the combined area of the Baltic Sea, North Sea and Western Waters. The list of stocks should be provided together with a mention of whether the stock is fished above or below Fmsy.

3. For the purpose of assessing changes over time in the coverage of advice on TACs with respect to scientific advice concerning the northeast Atlantic:
   a. define a sampling frame based on a large subset of TACs of EU interest that is stable over time;
   b. assess the number and proportion of those TACs that are subject to scientific advice concerning:
      i. the fishing mortality compared to Fmsy;
      ii. the state with respect to safe biological limits, as defined above.

For the purposes of this exercise, a group of TACs covering one biological stock should be counted once only. For a TAC which covers several stocks, the biological state of the most abundant stock (by comparison with other stocks over an extended and representative period) should be taken into account.

The Commission services will provide STECF with an initial analysis for the purposes of the assessment under point 3.

**STECF RESPONSE**

STECF reviewed the Report of the ad hoc Expert group noting that each of the elements of the terms of Reference to the STECF has been adequately and appropriately addressed. STECF notes that in its Report, the ad hoc Expert Group has provided source code in ‘R’ which will make future reporting on the performance of the CFP semi-automatic. The Report is logically presented and the data and STECF concludes that all of the data and information presented in the report can be used by the Commission as a basis to fulfil its obligations under Article 50 of the Common Fisheries Policy (Regulation (EU) No 1380/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 December 2013) for stocks in the ICES area, for which the EU fixes fishing opportunities.
1 - Information on STECF members and invited experts’ affiliations is displayed for information only. In some instances the details given below for STECF members may differ from that provided in Commission COMMISSION DECISION of 27 October 2010 on the appointment of members of the STECF (2010/C 292/04) as some members’ employment details may have changed or have been subject to organisational changes in their main place of employment. In any case, as outlined in Article 13 of the Commission Decision (2005/629/EU and 2010/74/EU) on STECF, Members of the STECF, invited experts, and JRC experts shall act independently of Member States or stakeholders. In the context of the STECF work, the committee members and other experts do not represent the institutions/bodies they are affiliated to in their daily jobs. STECF members and invited experts make declarations of commitment (yearly for STECF members) to act independently in the public interest of the European Union. STECF members and experts also declare at each meeting of the STECF and of its Expert Working Groups any specific interest which might be considered prejudicial to their independence in relation to specific items on the agenda. These declarations are displayed on the public meeting’s website if experts explicitly authorized the JRC to do so in accordance with EU legislation on the protection of personnel data. For more information: http://stecf.jrc.ec.europa.eu/adm-declarations

STECF members:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Tel.</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abella, J. Alvaro (vice-chair)</td>
<td>ARPAT – AREA MARE Agenzia Regionale per la Protezione Ambientale della Toscana Articolazione Funzionale RBM Risorse Ittiche e Biodiversità Marina Via Marradi 114, 57126 Livorno – Italia</td>
<td>0039-0555-3206956</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alvarojuan.abella@arpat.toscanait">alvarojuan.abella@arpat.toscanait</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andersen, Jesper Levring (vice-chair)</td>
<td>Department of Food and Resource Economics (IFRO) Section for Environment and Natural Resources University of Copenhagen Rolighedsvej 25 1958 Frederiksberg Denmark</td>
<td>Tel-dir.: +45 35 28 68 92</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jla@ifro.ku.dk">jla@ifro.ku.dk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bailey, Nicholas</td>
<td>Fisheries Research Services Marine Laboratory, P.O Box 101 375 Victoria Road, Torry Aberdeen AB11 9DB UK</td>
<td>Tel: +44 (0)1224 876544 295398 Fax: +44 (0)1224 295511</td>
<td><a href="mailto:baileyn@marlab.ac.uk">baileyn@marlab.ac.uk</a> <a href="mailto:n.bailey@marlab.ac.uk">n.bailey@marlab.ac.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bertignac, Michel</td>
<td>Laboratoire de Biologie Halieutique IFREMER Centre de Brest BP 70 - 29280 Plouzane, France</td>
<td>tel : +33 (0)2 98 22 45 25 - fax : +33 (0)2 98 22 46 53</td>
<td><a href="mailto:michel.bertignac@ifremer.fr">michel.bertignac@ifremer.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardinale, Massimiliano</td>
<td>Föreninggatan 45, 330 Lysekil, Sweden</td>
<td>Tel: +46 523 18750</td>
<td><a href="mailto:massimiliano.cardinale@slu.se">massimiliano.cardinale@slu.se</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Tel.</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curtis, Hazel</td>
<td>Sea Fish Industry Authority 18 Logie Mill Logie Green Road Edinburgh EH7 4HS</td>
<td>Tel: +44 (0)131 558 3331 Fax: +44 (0)131 558 1442</td>
<td><a href="mailto:H.Curtis@seafish.co.uk">H.Curtis@seafish.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaney, Alyne</td>
<td>Innovative Fisheries Management, -an Aalborg University Research Centre, Postboks 104, 9850 Hirtshals, Denmark</td>
<td>Tel: +45 9940 3694</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ad@ifm.aau.dk">ad@ifm.aau.dk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daskalov, Georgi</td>
<td>Laboratory of Marine Ecology, Institute of Biodiversity and Ecosystem Research, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences</td>
<td>Tel: +359 52 646892</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gmdaskalov@yahoo.co.uk">gmdaskalov@yahoo.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Döring, Ralf</td>
<td>Thünen Bundesforschungsinstitut, für Ländliche Räume, Wald und Fischerei, Institut für Seefischerei - AG Fischereiökonomie, Palmaire 9, D-22767 Hamburg, Germany</td>
<td>Tel.: 040 38905-185 Fax: 040 38905-263</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ralf.doering@ti.bund.de">ralf.doering@ti.bund.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gascuel, Didier</td>
<td>AGROCAMPUS OUEST 65 Route de Saint Brieuc, bat.4 CS 84215, F-35042 RENNES Cedex France</td>
<td>Tel:+33(0)2.23.48.55.34 Fax: +33(0)2.23.48.55.35</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Didier.Gascuel@agrocampus-ouest.fr">Didier.Gascuel@agrocampus-ouest.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham, Norman (chair)</td>
<td>Marine Institute, Fisheries Science Services (FSS), Rinville, Oranmore, Co. Galway, Ireland</td>
<td>Tel: + 353(0) 91 87200</td>
<td><a href="mailto:norman.graham@marine.ie">norman.graham@marine.ie</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garcia Rodriguez, Mariano</td>
<td>Instituto Español de Oceanografía, Servicios Centrales, Corazón de María 8, 28002, Madrid, Spain</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:Mariano.Garcia@md.ieo.es">Mariano.Garcia@md.ieo.es</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gustavsson, Tore Karl-Erik</td>
<td>Independent Consultant, Göteborg, Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:tore.gustavsson@hotmail.com">tore.gustavsson@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennings, Simon</td>
<td>CEFAS Lowestoft Laboratory, Pakefield Road, Lowestoft Suffolk, UK NR33 0HT</td>
<td>Tel: +44 1502562244 Fax: +44 1502513865</td>
<td><a href="mailto:simon.jennings@cefas.co.uk">simon.jennings@cefas.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenny, Andrew</td>
<td>CEFAS Lowestoft Laboratory, Pakefield Road, Lowestoft Suffolk, UK NR33 0HT</td>
<td>Tel: +44 1502562244 Fax: +44 1502513865</td>
<td><a href="mailto:andrew.kenny@cefas.co.uk">andrew.kenny@cefas.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kraak, Sarah</td>
<td>University College Cork Based at: Marine Institute, Rinville, Oranmore, Co Galway, Ireland</td>
<td>Tel: +353 (0)91 387392 Fax: +353 (0)91 387201</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Sarah.kraak@marine.ie">Sarah.kraak@marine.ie</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuikka, Sakari</td>
<td>University of Helsinki, Department of Environmental Sciences, P.O. Box 65 (Vitinkkaari 1), FI-00014 University of Helsinki, FINLAND</td>
<td>Tel: +358 50 3309233 Fax. +358-9-191 58754</td>
<td><a href="mailto:skuikka@mappi.helsinki.fi">skuikka@mappi.helsinki.fi</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Tel.</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STECF members</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Martin, Paloma</td>
<td>CSIC Instituto de Ciencias del Mar</td>
<td>Tel: 34.93.2309500 direct line : 34.93.2309552 Fax: 34.93.2309555</td>
<td><a href="mailto:paloma@icm.csic.es">paloma@icm.csic.es</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malvarosa, Loretta</td>
<td>NISEA S.c.a.r.l.</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:malvarosa@nisea.eu">malvarosa@nisea.eu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murua, Hilario</td>
<td>AZTI - Tecnalia / Unidad de Investigación Marina, Herrera kaia portualdea z/g 20110 Pasaia (Gipuzkoa), Spain</td>
<td>Tel: 0034 667174433 Fax: 94 6572555</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hmuru@azti.es">hmuru@azti.es</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nord, Jenny</td>
<td>The Swedish Agency of Marine and Water Management (SwAM)</td>
<td>Tel: 0046 76 140 140</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Jenny.nord@havochvatten.se">Jenny.nord@havochvatten.se</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nowakowski, Piotr</td>
<td>Maritime University of Szczecin, – Faculty of Food Science and Fisheries, Department of Fishing Technique, Szczecin</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:npfgd@poczta.onet.pl">npfgd@poczta.onet.pl</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prelezzo, Raul</td>
<td>AZTI - Tecnalia / Unidad de Investigación Marina</td>
<td>Tel: 94 6029400 Ext: 406- Fax: 94 6870006</td>
<td><a href="mailto:rprellezo@suk.azti.es">rprellezo@suk.azti.es</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sala, Antonello</td>
<td>Fishing Technology Unit National Research Council (CNR) Institute of Marine Sciences (ISMAR) - Fisheries Section Largo Fiera della Pesca, 1, 60125 Ancona - Italy</td>
<td>Tel: +39 071 2078841 Fax: +39 071 55313</td>
<td><a href="mailto:a.sala@ismar.cnr.it">a.sala@ismar.cnr.it</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scarcella, Giuseppe</td>
<td>Environmental Management Unit National Research Council (CNR) Institute of Marine Sciences (ISMAR) - Fisheries Section Largo Fiera della Pesca, 1, 60125 Ancona - Italy</td>
<td>Tel: +39 071 2078846 Fax: +39 071 55313</td>
<td><a href="mailto:g.scarcella@ismar.cnr.it">g.scarcella@ismar.cnr.it</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somarakis, Stylianos</td>
<td>Department of Biology University of Crete VassilikiVouton P.O. Box 2208 71409 Heraklion Crete Greece</td>
<td>Tel.: +30 2610 394065, +30 6936566764</td>
<td><a href="mailto:somarak@biology.uoc.gr">somarak@biology.uoc.gr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stransky, Christoph</td>
<td>Thünen Institute [TI-SF] Federal Research Institute for Rural Areas, Forestry and Fisheries, Institute of Sea Fisheries, Palmaille 9, D-22767 Hamburg, Germany</td>
<td>Tel. +49 40 38905-228 Fax: +49 40 38905-263</td>
<td><a href="mailto:christoph.stransky@ti.bund.de">christoph.stransky@ti.bund.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theret, Francois</td>
<td>Scapêche 17 Bd Abbé Le Cam 56100 Lorient France</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:ftheret@comata.com">ftheret@comata.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulrich, Clara</td>
<td>DTU Aqua, National Institute of Aquatic Resources, Technical University of Denmark, Charlottenlund Slot, JægersborgAllé 1, 2920 Charlottenlund, Denmark</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:cui@aquat.dtu.dk">cui@aquat.dtu.dk</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### STECF members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Tel.</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vanhee, Willy</td>
<td>ILVO - Institute for Agricultural and Fisheries Research</td>
<td>Tel 00-32-59-34-22-55</td>
<td><a href="mailto:willy.vanhee@ilvo.vlaanderen.be">willy.vanhee@ilvo.vlaanderen.be</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unit Animal Sciences - Fisheries</td>
<td>Fax 00-32-59-33-06-29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ankerstraat 1, B-8400 Oostende, Belgium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>van Oostenbrugge, Hans</td>
<td>LandbouwEconomishInstituut-LEI, Fisheries Section, Burg. Patijnlaan 19 P.O.Box 29703 2502 LS The Hague The Netherlands</td>
<td>Tel:+31 (0)70 3358239 Fax: +31 (0)70 3615624</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Hans.vanOostenbrugge@wur.nl">Hans.vanOostenbrugge@wur.nl</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Adhoc Expert Group participants

### JRC experts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Tel.</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Casey, John</td>
<td>European Commission, Joint Research Centre (IPSC), Maritime Affairs Unit Via E. Fermi, 2749 21027 Ispra (VA), Italy</td>
<td>(39) 0332 783936</td>
<td><a href="mailto:john.casey@jrc.ec.europa.eu">john.casey@jrc.ec.europa.eu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jardim, Ernesto</td>
<td>European Commission, Joint Research Centre (IPSC), Maritime Affairs Unit Via E. Fermi, 2749 21027 Ispra (VA), Italy</td>
<td>(39) 0332 785311</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ernesto.jardim@jrc.ec.europa.eu">ernesto.jardim@jrc.ec.europa.eu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mosqueira, Iago</td>
<td>European Commission, Joint Research Centre (IPSC), Maritime Affairs Unit Via E. Fermi, 2749 21027 Ispra (VA), Italy</td>
<td>(39) 0332 785413</td>
<td><a href="mailto:iago.mosqueira-sanchez@jrc.ec.europa.eu">iago.mosqueira-sanchez@jrc.ec.europa.eu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Osio, Giacomo Chato</td>
<td>European Commission, Joint Research Centre (IPSC), Maritime Affairs Unit Via E. Fermi, 2749 21027 Ispra (VA), Italy</td>
<td>(39) 0332 785948</td>
<td><a href="mailto:giacomo-chato.osio@jrc.ec.europa.eu">giacomo-chato.osio@jrc.ec.europa.eu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott, Finlay</td>
<td>European Commission, Joint Research Centre (IPSC), Maritime Affairs Unit Via E. Fermi, 2749 21027 Ispra (VA), Italy</td>
<td>(39) 0332 789610</td>
<td><a href="mailto:finlay.scott@jrc.ec.europa.eu">finlay.scott@jrc.ec.europa.eu</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REPORT TO THE STECF

AD HOC EXPERT GROUP on
Monitoring the Performance of the Common Fisheries Policy

Ispra, Italy, 10-11 February 2015

This report does not necessarily reflect the view of the STECF and the European Commission and in no way anticipates the Commission’s future policy in this area
Following the recommendations of STECF EWG 14-20 on Reporting needs on fishery resources under new CFP, an ad-hoc working group has produced an analysis to generate the requested indices of performance for 2013. Calculations were carried out using publicly available datasets of stock assessment results, which at this point limits the scope to those stocks for which scientific advice is provided by ICES.

Contents

1 Terms of reference 1
2 Participants 2
  2.1 Observers 3
3 Data and methods 3
  3.1 Data sources 3
  3.2 Methods 3
4 Findings in relation to each of the items in the Terms of Reference 3
  4.1 ToR 1: Determination of the sampling frame 3
  4.2 ToR 2: Indicators of management performance 4
  4.3 ToR 3: Indicators of changes in advice coverage 10
5 Status across all stocks in 2013 11
6 Appendix A: Source code 14
  6.1 Data loading and transformation 14
  6.2 ToR 1 17
  6.3 ToR 2 17
  6.4 ToR 3 19
  6.5 Stock table 20
References 20

1 Terms of reference

1. Determine, on the basis of the most recent available fish stock assessments, a list of fish stocks for monitoring the past performance of the Common Fisheries Policy according to the following criteria:

   a. Quantitative assessments as used in the provision of formal quantitative advice on fishing mortality with respect to Fmsy.

   b. Stocks in European Union waters, shared stocks which are jointly managed by the EU with nearby states, and stocks in international waters or third country waters.
that are fished by the EU and managed by an RFMO where the EU is a member of the decision making body.

2. For stocks within the sampling frame defined above, calculate the following annual quantities as far back in time as the data remain representative.

   a. Number of stocks where fishing mortality exceeds $F_{\text{MSY}}$ \(^1\)
   b. Number of stocks where fishing mortality is equal to or less than $F_{\text{MSY}}$ \(^2\)
   c. Number of stocks outside safe biological limits
   d. Number of stocks inside safe biological limits
   e. The arithmetic average value of $F/F_{\text{MSY}}$
   f. Number of stocks for which the state of the stock is unknown with respect to safe biological limits

For the purposes of this term of reference, “outside safe biological limits” means that SSB is less than $B_{\text{pa}}$ (where $B_{\text{pa}}$ is defined), OR $F$ is greater than $F_{\text{pa}}$ (where $F_{\text{pa}}$ is defined) for the year in question.

Estimates should be provided separately for the Baltic Sea, the North Sea, Western Waters, for each area covered by RFMOs other than NEAFC. Parameter f should also be reported for the combined area of the Baltic Sea, North Sea and Western Waters. The list of stocks should be provided together with a mention of whether the stock is fished above or below $F_{\text{MSY}}$.

3. For the purpose of assessing changes over time in the coverage of advice on TACs with respect to scientific advice concerning the northeast Atlantic:

   a. define a sampling frame based on a large subset of TACs of EU interest that is stable over time;
   b. assess the number and proportion of those TACs that are subject to scientific advice concerning:
      i. the fishing mortality compared to $F_{\text{MSY}}$;
      ii. the state with respect to safe biological limits, as defined above.

For the purposes of this exercise, a group of TACs covering one biological stock should be counted once only. For a TAC which covers several stocks, the biological state of the most abundant stock (by comparison with other stocks over an extended and representative period) should be taken into account.

The Commission services will provide STECF with an initial analysis for the purposes of the assessment under point 3.

2 Participants

- **J. Casey**, European Commission, Joint Research Center, IPSC/Maritime Affairs Unit G03, Via E. Fermi 2749, 21027 Ispra VA, Italy
- **E. Jardim**, European Commission, Joint Research Center, IPSC/Maritime Affairs Unit G03, Via E. Fermi 2749, 21027 Ispra VA, Italy
- **I. Mosqueira**, European Commission, Joint Research Center, IPSC/Maritime Affairs Unit G03, Via E. Fermi 2749, 21027 Ispra VA, Italy

---

\(^1\)Including, for short-lived species managed according to a biomass-escapement strategy, the number of stocks where the resulting biomass was less than the escapement biomass corresponding to MSY fishing.

\(^2\)Including, for short-lived species managed according to a biomass-escapement strategy, the number of stocks where the resulting biomass was equal to or higher than the escapement biomass corresponding to MSY fishing.
2.1 Observers

• K. Patterson, European Commission, DG MARE A.

3 Data and methods

3.1 Data sources

Calculation of the various indicators could at this point only be carried out for the areas for which advice is being provided by ICES. For other areas, a dataset could not be compiled due to the non-availability of an organized publicly available dataset of stock assessment results.

3.1.1 ICES

Results of quantitative stock assessments, including the adopted fishing mortality and biomass reference points, carried out by ICES were retrieved from the relevant section of the ICES website on 23 February 2015. Stock assessment results for Nephrops stocks, not currently included in that dataset, were provided in a similar format by ICES. Data for the IVa-VIa stock of Megrim were extracted from the relevant ICES report http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication%20Reports/Advice/2014/2014/meg-4a6a.pdf. These were not present in the ICES dataset as the assessment was carried out in 2013, but it was then subsequently used to provide advice in 2014.

This dataset was complemented with a list of the ecoregion each stock falls into, provided directly by ICES (see Appendix B). Stocks “of interest to the EU” were selected from this dataset. The final dataset compiled included 96 stocks.

3.2 Methods

Data was transformed, plotted and analysed using the R statistical language, version 3.1.2 (R Core Team 2014). Source code for the complete analysis is available in Appendix A.

4 Findings in relation to each of the items in the Terms of Reference

4.1 ToR 1: Determination of the sampling frame

The sampling frame determined under this ToR will be used for the computation of the indicators requested under ToR 2. Using the most recent fish stock assessment reports provided by ICES, stocks were chosen for inclusion in the indicators if:

• an estimate of the ratio of $F$ to $F_{MSY}$ is available, which was interpreted as evidence that a quantitative stock assessment is available and had been accepted for the provision of formal quantitative advice to the European Commission with respect to $F_{MSY}$.
- the stock had been identified together with DG MARE as of *EU relevance* for the monitoring of the implementation of the CFP.

The number of stocks thus included varies along the time series depending on the starting point of the stock assessment. All included stock assessments, 63 in total, go back to 1999 at least (Figure 1).

Figure 1: No. of stocks in the ICES area for which estimates of $F/F_{MSY}$ are available by year, and considered relevant for the monitoring of the CFP performance.

4.2 ToR 2: Indicators of management performance

Estimates of relative stock status were only considered for the 2003 - 2013 period, as the first date marks the start of the previous CFP European Commission (2002) and the later is the last year for which abundance and fishing mortality estimates are available from the 2014 stock assessment dataset.

For ToRs 2a to 2d two plots, showing the time series for the whole ICES area and for the four regions, and a table with the exact counts for each region and for all combined, are presented.
4.2.1 ToR 2.a: Number of stocks where fishing mortality exceeds Fmsy

Figure 2: Number of stocks where fishing mortality \( (F) \) exceeds fishing mortality at MSY \( (F_{MSY}) \) by year.

![Graph showing number of stocks where fishing mortality exceeds Fmsy by year.](image)

Figure 3: Number of stocks where fishing mortality \( (F) \) exceeds fishing mortality at MSY \( (F_{MSY}) \) by year.

![Graphs showing number of stocks by region.](image)

Table 1: Number of stocks where fishing mortality \( (F) \) exceeds fishing mortality at MSY \( (F_{MSY}) \) by region.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baltic Sea</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater North Sea</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western European</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widely distributed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.2 ToR 2.b: Number of stocks where fishing mortality is equal to or less than Fmsy

Figure 4: Number of stocks where fishing mortality ($F$) does not exceed fishing mortality at MSY ($F_{MSY}$) by year.

Figure 5: Number of stocks where fishing mortality ($F$) does not exceed fishing mortality at MSY ($F_{MSY}$) by year and region.

Table 2: Number of stocks where fishing mortality ($F$) does not exceed fishing mortality at MSY ($F_{MSY}$) by region.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baltic Sea</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater North Sea</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western European</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widely distributed</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.3 ToR 2.c: Number of stocks outside safe biological limits

Figure 6: Number of stocks outside safe biological limits by year.

Figure 7: Number of stocks outside safe biological limits by year and region.

Table 3: Number of stocks outside safe biological limits by region and for the whole ICES area. Outside safe biological limits means that SSB is less than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is greater than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baltic Sea</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater North Sea</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western European</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widely distributed</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.4 ToR 2.d: Number of stocks inside safe biological limits

Figure 8: Number of stocks inside safe biological limits by year.

Figure 9: Number of stocks inside safe biological limits by year and region.

Table 4: Number of stocks inside safe biological limits by region and for the whole ICES area. Inside safe biological limits means that SSB is greater than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is less than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baltic Sea</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater North Sea</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western European</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widely distributed</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.5 ToR 2.e: Arithmetic mean value of $F/F_{MSY}$

For this indicator only stocks not managed under escapement strategies were included. *Nephrops* stocks, for which fishing mortality was reported as a harvest rate, were also excluded, as values could not be directly combined. Harvest rate, defined as a proportion of the biomass (or numbers) being caught, has a non-linear relationship with fishing mortality, defined as an instantaneous rate, so should not combined linearly.

![Figure 10: Arithmetic mean value of the $F/F_{MSY}$ ratio by year.](image1)

![Figure 11: Arithmetic mean value of the $F/F_{MSY}$ ratio by year and region.](image2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>1.81</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>1.45</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baltic Sea</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>1.65</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater North Sea</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western European</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>2.09</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>1.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widely distributed</td>
<td>1.82</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.6 ToR 2.f: Number of stocks for which the state of the stock is unknown with respect to safe biological limits

At this point this indicator could not be calculated as the initial sampling frame is already limited to stocks for which quantitative advice is available. The status of the stock with respect to biomass levels is thus also known.

4.3 ToR 3: Indicators of changes in advice coverage

The sampling frame for this indicator was provided by MARE by selecting a subset of stocks comparable to those used in the calculation of CFP performance in previous years. This analysis is only computed on the current ICES dataset, which does not reflect the advice given in previous years. For example, if a stock was newly assessed in 2014, with data going back to 1999, the indicator computed from this dataset will be updated for the whole 1999-2013 period. A complete calculation of the advice coverage indicator would require the corresponding stock assessment dataset for previous years, which was outside the scope of this analysis.

Table 6: Number of stocks for which estimates exist of fishing mortality ($F$) over fishing mortality at MSY ($F_{MSY}$), and of biomass level against a safe biological limit, and corresponding proportions of all stocks in the sampling frame.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Proportion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stocks with $F/F_{MSY}$ estimate</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>56 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stocks with biomass estimate</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>59 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5 Status across all stocks in 2013

Table 7: Stock status for all stocks in the sampling frame in 2013. Columns refer to stock description, value of the $F_{2013}/F_{MSY}$ ratio ($F_{ind}$), $F_{2013}$ lower than $F_{MSY}$ ($F_{status}$), and whether the stock is inside safe biological limits (SBL). Inside safe biological limits means that SSB is greater than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is less than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Stock</th>
<th>F ind</th>
<th>F status</th>
<th>SBL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baltic Sea</td>
<td>Cod in Subdivisions 22-24 (Western Baltic Sea)</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Subdivisions 25 - 29 (excluding Gulf of Riga) and 32</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Subdivision 30 (Bothnian Sea)</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Division IIIa and Subdivisions 22 - 24 (Western Baltic spring spawners)</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Subdivision 28.1 (Gulf of Riga)</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sprat in Subdivisions 22 - 32 (Baltic Sea)</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater North Sea</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cod in Subarea IV (North Sea). Division VIIId (Eastern Channel) and IIIa West (Skagerrak)</td>
<td>2.09</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Haddock in Subarea IV and Divisions IIIa West and VIa (North Sea. Skagerrak and West of Scotland)</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Subarea IV and Divisions IIIa and VIIId (North Sea autumn spawners)</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nephrops in Farn Deeps (FU 6)</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nephrops in Fladen Ground (FU 7)</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nephrops in Firth of Forth (FU 8)</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nephrops in Moray Firth (FU 9)</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Norway Pout in Subarea IV (North Sea) and IIIa (Skagerrak - Kattegat) - Autumn assessment</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Northern shrimp (Pandalus borealis) in Divisions IIIa West and IVa East (Skagerrak and Norwegian Deeps)</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Plaice Subarea IV (North Sea)</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Saithe in Subarea IV (North Sea) Division IIIa West (Skagerrak) and Subarea VI (West of Scotland and Rockall)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sanded in the Dogger Bank area (SA 1)</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sanded in the South Eastern North Sea (SA 2)</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sanded in the Central Eastern North Sea (SA 3)</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sole in Division VIIId (Eastern Channel)</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sole in Division VIIe (Western Channel)</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sole in Division IIIa and Subdivisions 22-24 (Skagerrak, Kattegat, and the Belts)</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sole in Subarea IV (North Sea)</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sprat in Subarea IV (North Sea)</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Western European</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Black-bellied anglerfish (Lophius budegassa) in Divisions VIIIc and IXa</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White anglerfish (Lophius piscatorius) in Divisions VIIIc and IXa</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cod in Divisions VIIe-k (Celtic Sea cod)</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cod in Division VIIa (Irish Sea)</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cod in Division VIa (West of Scotland)</td>
<td>5.21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Haddock in Divisions VIIb.c.e-k</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Haddock in Division VIIb (Rockall)</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Division VIIa South of 52° 30’ N and VIIg.h.j.k (Celtic Sea and South of Ireland)</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Division VIIa North of 52° 30’ N (Irish Sea)</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Division VIa (North)</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Continued on next page
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Stock</th>
<th>F ind</th>
<th>F status</th>
<th>SBL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Widely distributed</td>
<td>Blue ling (Molva dypterygia) in Subdivision Vb. and Subareas VI and VII</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herring in Subareas I. II. V and Divisions IVa and XIVa (Norwegian spring-spawning herring)</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hake in Division IIIa. Subareas IV. VI and VII and Divisions VIIIa.b.d (Northern stock)</td>
<td>1.56</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Horse mackerel (Trachurus trachurus) in Divisions IIa. IVa. Vla. VIIa-c. e-k. VIII (Western stock)</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mackerel in the Northeast Atlantic (combined Southern. Western and North Sea spawning components)</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Roundnose grenadier (Coryphaenoides rupenstris) in Subareas VI and VII. and Divisions Vb and XIIb</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blue whiting in Subareas I-IX. XII and XIV (Combined stock)</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Stock</td>
<td>F ind</td>
<td>F status</td>
<td>SBL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hake in Division VIIIc and IXa (Southern stock)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.45</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horse mackerel (Trachurus trachurus) in Division IXa (Southern stock)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megrim (Lepidorhombus spp.) in Divisions IVa and VIa</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four-spot megrim (Lepidorhombus boscii) in Divisions VIIIc and IXa</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megrim (Lepidorhombus whiffiagonis) in Divisions VIIIc and IXa</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in North Minch (FU 11)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in South Minch (FU 12)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in the Firth of Clyde (FU 13)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in the Sound of Jura (FU 13)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in Irish Sea East (FU 14)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in Irish Sea West (FU 15)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops on Porcupine Bank (FU 16)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops on the Aran Grounds (FU 17)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops off the southeastern and southwestern coasts of Ireland (FU 19)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nephrops in the Smalls (FU 22)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plaice in Division VIIe (Western Channel)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sole in Divisions VIIa.b (Bay of Biscay)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sole in Divisions VIIIi. g (Celtic Sea)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sole in Division VIIa (Irish Sea)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whiting in Division VIIe-k</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>●</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6 Appendix A: Source code

6.1 Data loading and transformation

```r
library(dplyr)
library(reshape2)
library(ggplot2)
theme_set(theme_bw())
library(knitr)
opts_chunk$set(echo=FALSE, message=FALSE, warning=FALSE, fig.width=5, fig.height=3, fig.pos="H")
library(xtable)

# SET UP relative data folder
dir <- './data/

# so = ICES source stock assessment output database
so <- read.csv("./data/ices/20150223/StockAssessmentGraphs_2015223gbjgmz5bakko2audzwfskn.csv")

# sf = sampling frame
sf <- read.csv("./data/samplingFrame.csv")

# ne = Nephrops data
ne <- read.csv("./data/ices/20150227/nephrops.csv")
# HACK nep-13 to be split in a and b
ne$FishStock <- as.character(ne$FishStock)
ne$FishStock[ne$StockDescription == 'Nephrops in the Firth of Clyde (FU 13)'] <- "nep-13a"
ne$FishStock[ne$StockDescription == 'Nephrops in the Sound of Jura (FU 13)'] <- "nep-13b"
so <- rbind(so, ne)

# add ne
# spp, sppName, FishStock,
sfne <- ne[,c("SpeciesName", "SGName", "FishStock")]
names(sfne) <- c("spp", "sppName", "FishStock")
sfne$category <- 'D'
sfne$shared <- ""
sfne$TACunit <- ""
sfne$sfTACind <- TRUE
sf <- rbind(sf, sfne[c(1,4,5,2,6,3,7)])

# meg
# me* = megrins
meg <- read.csv("./data/ices/20150227/megrin/meg-4a6a.csv")

megdf <- so[1:29,]
megdf[, 'FishStock'] <- "meg-4a6a"
megdf$AssessmentKey <- NA
megdf$AssessmentYear <- '2014'
megdf$Year <- meg$Year
megdf$StockDescription <- "Megrim (Lepidorhombus spp.) in Divisions IVa and VIa"
megdf$SpeciesName <- "Lepidorhombus"
```
megdf$SGName <- "Megrims"
megdf$"Report" <- "http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/Publication%20Reports/Advice/2014/2014/meg-4a6a.pdf"

megdf[,c("UnitOfRecruitment")]<-

megdf[,"TBiomass"] <- meg$Biomass
megdf[,"Landings"] <- meg$Landings
megdf[,"Catches"] <- meg$Catch
megdf[,"Discards"] <- meg$Discards

so <- rbind(so, megdf)

# sf3 = sampling frame w/TAC
sf3 <- sf[sf$sfTACind,]
sf3 <- unique(sf3[,c("FishStock","sfTACind","category","shared")])

# sr = stock regions
sr <- read.csv("../data/stocksRegions.csv")

# qa = with quantitative advice
qa <- read.csv("../data/qa.csv")

# EUwaters = ecoregions
EUwaters <- c("Baltic Sea Ecoregion",
              "Bay of Biscay and the Iberian Coast Ecregion",
              "Celtic Seas Ecoregion", "Greater North Sea Ecoregion",
              "Widely distributed and migratory stocks", "Western European Waters")

# sampling frame for ToR 3: stock to be used for TAC indicator
sfTACind.n <- sum(sf3$sfTACind)
so <- merge(so, sf3, all=TRUE)
so$sfTACind[is.na(so$sfTACind)] <- FALSE

# Blim as Bref if Bpa doesn't exist
so$Bref <- so$Blim
so$Bref[!is.na(so$Bpa)] <- so$Bpa[!is.na(so$Bpa)]

# regions (merge BoB with CS) + external sfFind (by ken)
so <- merge(so, sr[,] c("FishStock", "ICES.Book", "eurelevant"), all=TRUE)
so$reg <- as.character(so$ICES.Book)
so$reg[so$reg %in% c("Celtic Seas Ecoregion",
                     "Bay of Biscay and the Iberian Coast Ecregion",
                     "Bay of Biscay and Iberian Sea") ] <- "Western European Waters"

# escapement strategy
so <- merge(so, qa[,] c("FishStock", "escapement"), all=TRUE)
so$escapement[is.na(so$escapement)] <- FALSE

# SUBSET
sa <- `select`(so, Year, FishStock, Landings, Catches, Discards, SSB, F, Bref, FMSY, sfTACind, reg, escapement, eurelevant, TypeStock)
names(sa) <- c("y", "stk", "L", "C", "D", "SSB","F","Bref","Fref", "sfTACind", "reg", "escapement", "eurelevant", "type")

# COMPUTE F/Fref | year + FishStock
sa <- `mutate` (sa, indF = F / Fref, indB=SSB/Bref)

# ADD meg ratios
sa[sa$stk == "meg-4a6a",'] <- meg$F.FMSY
sa[sa$stk == "meg-4a6a",'] <- 1

sa$indF[is.infinite(sa$indF)] <- NA
sa$indB[is.infinite(sa$indB)] <- NA

# in case of escapement strategy MSY evaluated by SSB ~ Blim/Bpa/etc
sa$indF[sa$escapement] <- sa$Bref[sa$escapement]/sa$SSB[sa$escapement]

# COMPUTE SBL | year + FishStock
sa$SBL <- apply(sa,1, function(x)
  !as.logical(sum(x["F"] > x["Fref"] | x["SSB"] < x["Bref"], na.rm=TRUE)))

# if both are NA SBL must be NA
sa$SBL[is.na(sa$indF) & is.na(sa$indB)] <- NA

# ToR 1.a (id quantitative assessments as those stocks that have F and Fmsy estimates in 2013 and not relative)
df0 <- subset(sa, y==2013)[,c("stk", "indF", "type")]
df0 <- transform(df0, qa = indF>0 & type="Relative")
df0$qa[is.na(df0$qa)] <- FALSE
sa <- `merge` (sa, df0[,c("stk", "qa")])

# ToR 1.b (add to external definition those stocks that are relevant to the EU, external file)
sa <- `transform` (sa, eurelevant = as.logical(eurelevant))

# Find sampling frame
v0 <- `with` (sa, qa & eurelevant)
v0[is.na(v0)] <- FALSE
sa$sffind <- v0

# remove some stocks
# cod-2532, FMSY estimate not used for advice
# nep-32:
# Nop-34-june: keep october SA
sa$sffind[sa$stk %in% c("nep-32", "Nop-34-june", "cod-2532")]] <- FALSE

# final table
samplingFrames <- unique(sa[,c("stk","sfTACind","sffind")])
6.2 ToR 1

```
```

6.3 ToR 2

```
# remove some stocks and years
sf2 <- with(sa, sfFind & y >= 2003 & y < 2014)
```  

6.3.1 ToR 2a

```
fInda <- rbind_list(
  # find by year
  sa[sf2,] %>% group_by(year=y) %>% summarise(Region='ALL', N=sum(indF>1, na.rm=TRUE)),
  # find by region
  sa[sf2,] %>% group_by(Region=reg, year=y) %>% summarise(N=sum(indF>1, na.rm=TRUE)))
```  

```
fInda$Region <- factor(fInda$Region, levels=sort(unique(fInda$Region)),
  labels=c('All', 'Baltic Sea', 'Greater North Sea', 'Western European', 'Widely distributed'))
```  

```
```

6.3.2 ToR 2b

```
fIndb <- rbind_list( 
  # find by year 
  sa[sf2,] %>% group_by(year=y) %>% summarise(Region='ALL', 
    N=sum(indF<=1, na.rm=TRUE)),
  # find by region 
  sa[sf2,] %>% group_by(Region=reg, year=y) %>% summarise(N=sum(indF<=1, na.rm=TRUE)))
```  

```
fIndb$Region <- factor(fIndb$Region, levels=sort(unique(fIndb$Region)),
  labels=c('All', 'Baltic Sea', 'Greater North Sea', 'Western European', 'Widely distributed'))
```  

```
```
6.3.3 ToR 2c

```r
fIndc <- rbind_list(
  # find by year
  sa[sf2,] %>%
  group_by(year) %>%
  summarise(Region='ALL',
         N=sum(!SBL, na.rm=TRUE)),
  # find by region
  sa[sf2,] %>%
  group_by(Region=reg, year) %>%
  summarise(N=sum(!SBL, na.rm=TRUE))
)

fIndc$Region <- factor(fInda$Region, levels=sort(unique(fInda$Region)),
                        labels=c('All', 'Baltic Sea', 'Greater North Sea', 'Western European',
                                'Widely distributed'))

ggplot(filter(fIndc, Region=='All'),
       aes(x=year, y=N)) +
  geom_line() +
  expand_limits(y=0) +
  geom_point(aes(x=2003, y=N[1])) +
  geom_point(aes(x=2013, y=N[length(N)]), size=2) +
  ylab("No. of stocks") +
  xlab("") +
  ylim(c(0,55))
```

6.3.4 ToR 2d

```r
fIndd <- rbind_list(
  # find by year
  sa[sf2,] %>%
  group_by(year) %>%
  summarise(Region='ALL',
         N=sum(SBL, na.rm=TRUE)),
  # find by region
  sa[sf2,] %>%
  group_by(Region=reg, year) %>%
  summarise(N=sum(SBL, na.rm=TRUE))
)
```

---

ToR 2c

Widely distributed

```r
ggplot(filter(fIndb, Region=='All'), aes(x=year, y=N)) +
  geom_line() +
  geom_point(aes(x=2003, y=N[1])) +
  geom_point(aes(x=2013, y=N[length(N)]), size=2) +
  ylim(c(0,55))
ggplot(filter(fIndb, Region != 'All'), aes(x=year, y=N)) +
  geom_line() +
  facet_wrap(~Region, scales='free') +
  ylab("No. of stocks") +
  xlab("") +
  scale_x_continuous(breaks = seq(2003, 2013, length=5)) +
  ylim(0, NA)
kable(dcast(filter(fIndb, year > 2002), Region~year, value.var='N'),
      caption = "Number of stocks outside safe biological limits by region and for the whole ICES area. Outside safe biological limits means that SSB is less than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is greater than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).")
```

---

ToR 2d

```r
ggplot(filter(fIndc, Region=='All'),
       aes(x=year, y=N)) +
  geom_line() +
  geom_point(aes(x=2003, y=N[1])) +
  geom_point(aes(x=2013, y=N[length(N)]), size=2) +
  ylab("No. of stocks") +
  xlab("") +
  ylim(c(0,55))
ggplot(filter(fIndc, Region != 'All'),
       aes(x=year, y=N)) +
  geom_line() +
  facet_wrap(~Region, scales='free') +
  ylab("No. of stocks") +
  xlab("") +
  scale_x_continuous(breaks = seq(2003, 2013, length=5)) +
  ylim(0, NA)
kable(dcast(filter(fIndd, year > 2002), Region~year, value.var='N'),
      caption = "Number of stocks outside safe biological limits by region and for the whole ICES area. Outside safe biological limits means that SSB is less than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is greater than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).")
```
fIndd$Region <- factor(fInda$Region, levels=sort(unique(fInda$Region)), labels=c('All', 'Baltic Sea', 'Greater North Sea', 'Western European', 'Widely distributed'))

ggplot(filter(fIndd, Region=='All'), aes(x=year, y=N)) + geom_line() + expand_limits(y=0) + geom_point(aes(x=2003, y=N[1])) + geom_point(aes(x=2013, y=N[length(N)]), size=2) + ylab("No. of stocks") + xlab("") + ylim(c(0,55))

ggplot(filter(fIndd, Region != 'All'), aes(x=year, y=N)) + geom_line() + facet_wrap(~Region, scales='free') + ylab("No. of stocks") + xlab("") + scale_x_continuous(breaks = seq(2003, 2013, length=5)) + ylim(0, NA)

kable(dcast(filter(fIndd, year > 2002), Region~year, value.var='N'), digits=2, caption = "Number of stocks inside safe biological limits by region and for the whole ICES area. Inside safe biological limits means that SSB is greater than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is less than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).")

6.3.5 ToR 2e

idx <- seq(1, dim(sa)[1]) %in% grep("nep-\*", sa$stk, invert=TRUE)
fInde <- rbind_list(
  # find by year
  sa[sf2 & !sa$escapement & idx,] %>%
  group_by(year=y) %>%
  summarise(Region='ALL',
    F=mean(indF, na.rm=TRUE)),
  # find by region
  sa[sf2 & !sa$escapement & idx,] %>%
  group_by(Region=reg,
           year=y) %>%
  summarise(F=mean(indF, na.rm=TRUE))
)

fInde$Region <- factor(fInde$Region, levels=sort(unique(fInde$Region)), labels=c('All', 'Baltic Sea', 'Greater North Sea', 'Western European', 'Widely distributed'))

ggplot(filter(fInde, Region=='All'), aes(x=year, y=F)) + geom_line() + expand_limits(y=0) + geom_point(aes(x=2003, y=F[1])) + geom_point(aes(x=2013, y=F[length(F)]), size=2) + ylab(expression(F/F[MSY])) + xlab("")

ggplot(filter(fInde, Region != 'All'), aes(x=year, y=F)) + geom_line() + facet_wrap(~Region) + ylab(expression(F/F[MSY])) + xlab("") + geom_hline(aes(yintercept=1), linetype=2) + scale_x_continuous(breaks = seq(2003, 2013, length=5))

kable(dcast(filter(fInde, year > 2002), Region~year, value.var='F'), digits=2, caption = "Arithmetic mean value of the $F/F_{MSY}$ ratio by year and region.")

6.4 ToR 3

sf3 <- with(sa, sfTACind & y == 2013)

with(sa[sf3,], tapply(indF, y, function(x) sum(!is.na(x))))
6.5 Stock table

```r
# indF>1, SBL, indF
dat <- sa[sf2,] %>% filter(y==2013) %>% select(c(reg, stk, indF, SBL))

tab <- merge(dat, unique(so[,c(1, 5)]), by.x="stk", by.y='FishStock')
tab$Flim <- ifelse(tab$indF<1, '$\bullet$', '')
tab$SBL <- ifelse(tab$SBL, '$\bullet$', '')
tab <- tab[, c(2,5,3,6,4)]
tab <- tab[order(tab$reg),]
tab[duplicated(tab$reg),`reg`] <- ''
tab$reg <- factor(tab$reg, labels=c('','Baltic Sea', 'Greater North Sea', 'Western European', 'Widely distributed'))

names(tab) <- c("Region", "Stock", "F ind", "F status", "SBL")
#tab <- xtable(tab, caption="Stock status for all stocks in the sampling frame in 2013. Columns refer to stock ... limits means that SSB is greater than Bpa (where Bpa is defined), or F is less than Fpa (where Fpa is defined).")
tab <- xtable(tab)
addtorow <- list()
addtorow$pos <- list()
addtorow$pos[[1]] <- c(0)
addtorow$command <- c(paste("\\hline 
","\\endhead 
","\\hline 
","{\\footnotesize Continued on next page} 
","\\endfoot 
","\\endlastfoot 
",sep=''))

print(tab, type='latex', include.rownames=FALSE, floating=FALSE, floating.environment='longtable', tabular.environment="longtable", booktabs=TRUE, sanitize.text.function=function(x){x}, comment=FALSE, add.to.row = addtorow)
```

References


Europe Direct is a service to help you find answers to your questions about the European Union
Freephone number (*): 00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11
(*) Certain mobile telephone operators do not allow access to 00 800 numbers or these calls may be billed.

A great deal of additional information on the European Union is available on the Internet.
It can be accessed through the Europa server http://europa.eu.

How to obtain EU publications

Our publications are available from EU Bookshop (http://publications.europa.eu/howto/index_en.htm),
where you can place an order with the sales agent of your choice.

The Publications Office has a worldwide network of sales agents.
You can obtain their contact details by sending a fax to (352) 29 29-42758.

European Commission

EUR 27152 EN – Joint Research Centre – Institute for the Protection and Security of the Citizen

Authors:

STECF members:
Graham, N., J., Abella, J. A., Andersen, J., Bailey, N., Bertignac, M., Cardinale, M., Curtis, H., Daskalov, G., Delaney, A.,
Döring, R., Garcia Rodriguez, M., Gascuel, D., Gustavsson, T., Jennings, S., Kenny, A., Kraak, S., Kuikka, S., Malvarosa, L.,
Ulrich, C., Vanhee, W. & Van Oostenbrugge, H.

Ad hoc Expert group members:
Casey, J.,Jardim, E., Mosqueira, I., Osio, G.C., Scott, F.

Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union

2015 – 32 pp. – 21 x 29.7 cm

EUR – Scientific and Technical Research series – ISSN 1831-9424 (online), ISSN 1018-5593 (print)


doi:10.2788/161399
STECF

The Scientific, Technical and Economic Committee for Fisheries (STECF) has been established by the European Commission. The STECF is being consulted at regular intervals on matters pertaining to the conservation and management of living aquatic resources, including biological, economic, environmental, social and technical considerations.

JRC Mission

As the Commission’s in-house science service, the Joint Research Centre’s mission is to provide EU policies with independent, evidence-based scientific and technical support throughout the whole policy cycle.

Working in close cooperation with policy Directorates-General, the JRC addresses key societal challenges while stimulating innovation through developing new methods, tools and standards, and sharing its know-how with the Member States, the scientific community and international partners.

Serving society
Stimulating innovation
Supporting legislation

doi:10.2788/161399